

PROPOSED
MINUTES OF THE
STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING

May 10, 2010, 10:00 A.M.
LAKE ERIE ROOM, MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER
702 WEST KALAMAZOO STREET, LANSING, MICHIGAN

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Janese Chapman, Lynn Evans, Richard Harms, Elisabeth Knibbe, Ted Ligibel, Carolyn Loeb, Jennifer Radcliff, Ron Staley

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Scott Beld

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Amy Arnold, Laura Ashlee, Bob Christensen, Brian Conway, Mollie Douglas, Scott Grammer, Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock, Andrew Haan, John Halsey, Martha MacFarlane-Faes, Diane Tuinstra, Todd Walsh

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PRESENT

Timothy Boscarino, concerning Detroit Public Schools Multiple Property Nomination
Joseph Burreighs, concerning Glenwood Cemetery
Deborah Goldstein, concerning Detroit Public Schools Multiple Property Nomination
Nancy Finegood, concerning Detroit Public Schools Multiple Property Nomination
Chris Frost, concerning Fourth & Fifth Avenues Historic District, and Prudence C. Spink
v. Ann Arbor Historic District Commission
Kevin McDonald, concerning Prudence C. Spink v. Ann Arbor Historic District
Commission
Pat Meyer, concerning Cobbs & Mitchell Building
Karen Nagher, concerning Detroit Public Schools Multiple Property Nomination
Gary Scheurer
List of members of public in attendance includes three names written illegibly.

Harms called the meeting to order at 10:04 a. m.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Chapman moved approval of agenda.
Evans supported Chapman's motion.
Vote: 7-0

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Radcliff moved approval of the minutes of the January 15, 2010 meeting.

Staley supported Radcliff's motion.
Vote: 7-0

Knibbe arrive at 10:14 a. m.

STAFF REPORTS

Brian Conway, State Historic Preservation Office

- Staff changes: Nick Bozen has returned from medical leave, Scott Grammer is now employed by the SHPO, Mollie Douglas and Jessica Williams have recently been hired by the SHPO as part of the Weatherization Assistance Program.
- Conway introduced the Executive Director of the Michigan State Housing Development Authority (MSHDA), Keith Molin.
 - Molin stated that the mission of MSHDA has evolved from building houses to building communities, and historic preservation is a part of strong communities.
- Andrew Haan and Nathan Nietering, students at Eastern Michigan University, are working with the SHPO as student assistants.
- Wednesday, May 5, was the Governor's Awards for Historic Preservation ceremony.
 - The year's ceremony featured the largest number of state legislators in attendance.
 - Six projects were honored with an award: Pointe Betsie Lighthouse, Grand Rapids Water Filtration Plant, Witherbees Market, Fort Shelby Hotel, Argonaut Building, and the Window Rehabilitation Workshop conducted in partnership with the city of Kalamazoo, and the Michigan Historic Preservation Workshop.
 - Ceremonies will also be held in several of the award winner's communities.
- The SHPO has a new logo.
- The Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) has awarded the SHPO a \$700,000 grant to upgrade the historic site database and create a Geographic Information System (GIS).
 - Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock has been working towards this for several years.
- The Special Consideration Tax Credits were awarded to the former United States Postal Service building in Grand Rapids, and to the Knapp's Building in Lansing.
- The first round of 2010 Enhanced Historic Preservation Tax Credit applications are currently undergoing review.
- The SHPO has seen an eighteen-fold increase (2007-2010) in the number of projects being reviewed under Section 106 due to stimulus funds activities.
 - A programmatic agreement has been completed with the Department of Energy and the Department of Human Services to streamline the implementation of Section 106 reviews being undertaken with Weatherization Assistance Program funds.
- SHPO is working closely with MSHDA to streamline reviews for Neighborhood Stabilization Program (NSP) projects.

- The Request for Proposal for the Michigan Modern project is scheduled to be released next week.
- Eight Michigan Lighthouse Assistance Program grant awards will be awarded. The lighthouses are: Cheboygan River Front Range, Fort Gratiot, Grand Traverse lighthouse, Gull Rock Lighthouse, Little Sable Point, Old Mission Point, Pointe Aux Barques, and Whitefish Point.
- The MHPN conference is May 12-16.
- The Michigan Lighthouse Alliance conference is in Traverse City on June 14-17.
- The National Alliance of Preservation Commissions annual meeting will be held in Grand Rapids at the end of July.
- The National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers quarterly board meeting will also be held at the end of July.
 - Conway has been asked to plan a tour for the NCSHPO group, and is planning a Michigan Modern-themed tour, as well as a tour of West Michigan points of interest.

John Halsey, State Archaeologist

- On April 2, 2010, the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP) issued comments concerning the construction of the Cape Wind Energy Project on Horseshoe Shoal in Nantucket Sound, Massachusetts.
 - The project consists of 130 400-foot high wind turbines in a 25-square mile section of Nantucket Sound.
 - The project will result in the reduction of carbon dioxide emissions by 700,000 tons annually.
 - The ACHP found that many historic properties would be adversely affected (“34 historic properties including 16 historic districts and 12 individually significant sites on Cape Cod, Martha’s Vineyard, and Nantucket Island, and six properties of religious and cultural significance to tribes”).
 - The ACHP also found that negative affects would be both direct and indirect, cannot be avoided, and cannot be satisfactorily mitigated.
 - On April 29, 2010, the United States Secretary of the Interior, Ken Salazar, announced that the Cape Wind Energy Project had received approval.
 - The repercussions of this decision will be noticed beyond the Cape.
 - The State of Michigan is currently involved in a planning process to determine what would be necessary to construct similar wind projects in the Great Lakes.
 - Objections to such projects are similar to those raised in the Cape Wind project.
- Researchers from the University of Michigan believe they have found evidence of early caribou hunters on a ridge in Lake Huron.
 - To date, no artifacts have been found.
 - Research is continuing, and divers will survey the site at a later date.

NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

Site: Glenwood Cemetery

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Ligibel

Support: Loeb

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: C; consideration: d

Level of Significance: State

Radcliff asked if the Platte River had been channeled through the area, or if it was a naturally occurring feature.

Ligibel asked if the lack of non-contributing buildings was accurate. Christensen stated that he found none in his analysis of the cemetery.

Site: Charles G. Janson Garage

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Knibbe

Support: Chapman

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, B

Level of Significance: Local

Ligibel asked if there was a state-wide context on early automobile dealerships. Christensen replied that there certainly was no such document.

Ligibel also asked about the use of the term façade. He stated that students in the Eastern Michigan University historic preservation program are trained to use façade only in terms of the main, front-facing elevation of a building. Knibbe replied that, in architectural terms, façade refers to any face of a building. Conway concurred with Knibbe's response.

Site: Cobbs & Mitchell Building

Presented By: MacFarlane-Faes

Moved for Approval: Evans

Support: Knibbe

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, B, C

Level of Significance: State

Harms asked if the nomination should be nominated at the state-level significance. MacFarlane-Faes replied that the nomination, as written, notes local-level significance. Conway stated that the building should be listed at the state-level. Harms stated that Cadillac was not a lumber "capital." Muskegon produced more lumber than Cadillac, and Bay City and Saginaw produced even more lumber than Muskegon. Harms further noted that Cadillac was not even the capital of hardwood lumbering, and that the pine supply was not exhausted, rather the remaining supply was not reachable in an economically

feasible manner. Christensen, replying to the question of state or local-level significance, noted that it is hard to find a comparison as the company itself was similar to many such companies around the state, though the building itself seemed to warrant state-level significance. Harms replied that, in terms of hardwood lumber industry, this building is likely the foremost building in the state. Radcliff added that the story of lumber is a state story, with the implications of the industry reaching throughout the state. Ligibel noted that the nomination notes that the period of significance ends in 1969. Christensen replied that he must have an earlier draft of the nomination as it was corrected and resent. Ligibel asked if tourism planning was key to this building. Meyer replied that one of the goals of MDOT was to open up MI-131 and the northern Lower Peninsula for residents in the southern Lower Peninsula. Halsey asked why the period of state ownership is not considered significant. Christensen replied that state ownership was addressed in the nomination, and that information could not be located that would suggest any significant activities had taken place in the building. Harms stated that it would be worth mentioning in the nomination that this building was central to the effort of the state to transition economy of the region to a tourism-based economy.

Site: Odd Fellows Valley Lodge No. 189 Building

Presented By: Douglas

Moved for Approval: Staley

Support: Chapman

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, B, C

Level of Significance: Local

Evans asked if the site was being nominated under criteria A, B, and C, or just B and C. Christensen confirmed A, B, and C. Radcliff asked if there was a local historic district where the building was located. Walsh and Conway replied that, to their knowledge, there was not.

Site: USS LST-393

Presented By: Grevstad-Nordbrock

Moved for Approval: Chapman

Support: Radcliff

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: National

Level of Significance: A, C

Harms noted that the owner of the USS LST-393 has objected to the listing of the vessel in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). Conway noted that responsibility of the Board is to either recommend or not recommend listing, and the Keeper of the NRHP will determine eligibility, and in the meantime the SHPO will try to contact owner and attempt to assuage any concerns they may have regarding listing in the NRHP. Ligibel asked about the usage of the word "holed" in the context of the condition of a flag on page six in the nomination. Ligibel also noted that the ending of the nomination should be

focused on the role of the ship in winning the war, and not on the number of soldiers, sailors, and marines killed during the war.

--The Board decided to hear the Detroit Public Schools nomination after hearing the Local Historic District Commission Appeals in order to allow Knibbe to have input on the decisions prior to leaving.

LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPEALS

Presented by Scott Grammer

Appeal: John Porsondeck v. Saugatuck Historic District Commission

Motion: Knibbe motioned to reject the Proposal for Decision, and to uphold the decision of the Saugatuck Historic District Commission.

Support: Radcliff

Vote: 8-0

Loeb asked if any alternatives were offered by the Saugatuck Historic District Commission (SHDC). Grammer replied that no alternatives were offered. Bozen asked if the local ordinance requiring action by the property owner within one year after receiving approval was quoted in the PFD. Grammer replied that it was not noted. Knibbe asked for clarification whether certain portions of work undertaken on the property were actually approved.

Appeal: Fred & Kathryn Dunn v. Rochester Hills Historic District Commission

Motion: Knibbe motioned to affirm the Proposal for Decision, and to uphold the decision by the Rochester Hills Historic District Commission.

Support: Chapman

Vote: 8-0

Appeal: Prudence C. Spink v. Ann Arbor Historic District Commission

Motion: Knibbe motioned to uphold the decision of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission provided the existing windows are in original wooden track without added hardware and the wood is not rotted.

Support: Ligibel

Vote: 8-0

Knibbe stated that the Administrative Law Judge misinterpreted the Board's comments in a previous case, which indicated that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards should be implemented in a flexible manner. Knibbe added that the idea of using a percentage to determine flexibility is not what the Board intended. Knibbe further stated that the central question in this case is whether the windows in question were original or not, and if not, are they substantially different from the other windows in the house. Knibbe opined that the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission is trying to take a nuanced and flexible approach to determining if materials are appropriate. Radcliff stated that she thought that materials used in the construction of a house are on a continuum and that some materials may not be original, but are still historic.

--Continuation of National Register of Historic Places nominations

Site: Detroit Public Schools

Presented By: Boscarino

Moved for Approval: see Attachment A

Support: see Attachment A

Vote: see Attachment A

Criteria: see Attachment A

Level of Significance: see Attachment A

Harms asked if “city historian” is an official city position. Goldstein and Chapman replied that it is. Knibbe expressed concern for the number of buildings constructed near the end of the period of significance, and stated that the buildings should be truly significant, and not just a representative example, to be designated.

The Board decided that they would here a quick summary of the building, its related criteria, and the level of significance, then a vote on each building would be held. Discussion would be saved for the end of the presentation.

Knibbe asked if a map was available.

Radcliff observed that there were a number of buildings not on this list. Chapman replied that all of the buildings were inventoried, but some were not included due to lack of integrity.

Chapman abstained from all voting for the Detroit Public School Multiple Property Nomination and all individual nominations.

Ligibel expressed appreciation for the work that went into producing the nominations, and for the completeness of the information contained therein.

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMITTEE STUDY REPORTS:

Presented by Amy Arnold

Keppel’s Village Historic District, Holland

The Board made no additional comment.

Stauch Family House, Royal Oak

The Board made no additional comment.

Fourth & Fifth Avenues Historic District, Ann Arbor

The Board made no additional comment.

Owosso Downtown Historic District, Owosso

The Board made no additional comment.

Mechanic Street Historic District, Jackson

The Board made no additional comment.

DATE OF NEXT MEETINGS

January 21, 2011

ADJOURNMENT

Staley motioned to adjourn

X supported Staley's motion

Vote: 8-0, adjournment at 1:42 p. m.

Prepared by T. Walsh

ATTACHMENT A
PROPOSED
 MINUTES OF THE
STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING
 May 10, 2010, 10:00 A.M.
 LAKE ERIE ROOM, MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER
 702 WEST KALAMAZOO STREET, LANSING, MICHIGAN

SCHOOL	ACTION	LEVEL	CRITERIA/ON	MOTION	SUPPORT	VOTE and NOTES
Detroit Multiple Property Nomination				Evans	Ligibel	6-0 Knibbe left prior to this vote being held.
Rose School	List	Local	C	Evans	Staley	7-0
McKinstry School	List	State	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0 Conway asked if this school was still an operating school. Boscarino confirmed that it was.
Wingert School	List	State	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0 Conway asked if this school was still an operating school. Boscarino confirmed that it was.
Doty School	List	State	C	Staley	Knibbe	7-0
Maybury School	List	State	C	Staley	Ligibel	7-0
Joyce & Barbour Schools	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Crossman School	List	Local	C	Radcliff	Staley	7-0
Sampson School	List	Local	C	Knob	Ligibel	7-0
Burton School	List	Local	C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Stephens School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Evans	7-0 Knibbe asked if there was any reason why the Detroit Historic Designation Advisory Board voted to not recommend this building for

						listing. Boscarino replied that he wasn't aware of any reasons other than the DHDAB's opinion that the building's style was better represented by other buildings.
Thirkell School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Northern School	List	Local	C	Staley	Ligibel	7-0 Chapman pointed out that this building has been leased to a charter school.
Breitmeyer School	List	Local	C			Failed for lack of a motion. Chapman pointed out that this building will be demolished by the City of Detroit.
Carstens School	List	Local	C	Evans	Ligibel	7-0 Ligibel stated that this building appears to be a nice mix of the Arts & Crafts and Spanish styles, and that you don't see many such buildings in Michigan.
Nordstrum & Southwestern School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Radcliff	7-0 Ligibel asked if the glass enclosure between the two buildings was included in the nomination. Boscarino replied that the connection makes the two buildings one in the eyes of the National Register.
Southeastern & Foch School	List	State	C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Neinas School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0 Radcliff why this building was listed under the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The board recommended changing the style to Renaissance Revival.

Harms School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0
Miller School	List	Local	A, C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Custer School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
White School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Evans	7-0
Balch School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0
Brady School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0 Boscarino noted that the DHDAB voted against recommending the listing of this school. Chapman pointed out that this school is closed. Knibbe asked if this building was located in an area with good adaptive re-use potential. Ligibel noted that this was the first example of Tudor Gothic/Collegiate Gothic the Board has seen in this series of nominations.
Hutchins School	List	Local	C	Evans	Radcliff	7-0
Winterhalter School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Cass Tech School	List	State	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0 Knibbe stated that this building has low adaptive re-use potential due to its difficult and inefficient floor plan. Ashlee stated that significance is not based on re-use potential. Ligibel stated that this is a signature building within the Detroit Public School system.
Poe & Edmonson School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0 Knibbe asked if both buildings were listed as contributing. Boscarino replied that they are. The Board recommended that Poe be listed as contributing, and that Edmonson be listed as non-contributing. Boscarino

						pointed out that Edmonson is open and Poe is closed. Goldstein noted that this complex is a good example of the standard site plan used by the DPS system. Boscarino stated the site is the only example in the city of two elementary schools being placed on the same site.
Guyton School	List	Local	C	Staley	Evans	7-0 Goldstein noted that the system contains two other examples of this type of architecture, but the staff had to choose one example.
Noble School	List	Local	C	Evans	Ligibel	7-0
Duffield School	List	Local	A, C	Radcliff	Staley	7-0
Sherrill School	List	Local	C	Staley	Radcliff	7-0
Clinton School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Staley	7-0 Boscarino noted that the HDAVB recommended against listing this school.
Ruthruff School	List	Local	C	Staley	Loeb	7-0
Fitzgerald & Post School	List	Local	A, C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Roosevelt Group School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0 Goldstein noted that an elementary school was once a part of this group of schools, but it is no longer extant.
Nolan School	List	State	C	Ligibel	Loeb	7-0 Ligibel asked if this was the first of the Smith, Hinchman & Grylls-designed schools
MacCulloch School	List	Local	C	Radcliff	Staley	7-0
Higginbotham School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Evan	7-0
McKerrow	List	State	C	Staley	Loeb	7-0

School						
Cleveland School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evan	7-0
Atkinson School	List	Local	A, C	Radcliff	Staley	7-0 Chapman noted that this building has been sold to a charter school.
Cooley School	List	State	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Munger & Chadsey School	List	State	A, C	Staley	Evans	7-0 Ligibel asked why this building was listed at state-level significance. Boscarino replied that it is associated with N. C. Sorenson.
Hamilton School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Evan	7-0
Stellwagen School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Macomb School	List	Local	C	Staley	Radcliff	7-0 Radcliff asked about the date of the addition. Boscarino noted that the addition is a separate building constructed in the early 2000s.
Marshall School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Wayne School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0
Halley School	List	Local	C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Richard School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Hampton School	List	Local	C	Evans	Loeb	7-0
Jackson School	List	State	C	Staley	Radcliff	7-0 Ligibel asked if any of these buildings were of national significance. Boscarino replied that none of the buildings were nominated at national-level significance.
Finney School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Mackenzie School	List	Local	A, C	Evans	Loeb	7-0

Columbus School	List	Local	C	Staley	Loeb	7-0
Pershing School	List	State	A, C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Oakman School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Staley	7-0
Greenfield Union School	List	A, C		Staley	Loeb	7-0
Grayling School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Loeb	7-0 Boscarino noted that the HDAB recommended against listing this building as they felt there were better examples of this style of Architecture. Radcliff stated “there are other better examples until there aren’t.” Harms added that the building either is or isn’t eligible for listing in the National Register.
North Strathmoor School	List	Local	A, C	Evans	Staley	7-0
Cerveny School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Knibbe	7-0
Lynch School	List	Local	A, C	Staley	Evans	7-0 Ligibel asked if the architect was known. Boscarino replied that the architect was not known as the municipality did not have the records for this building.
Hanstein School	List	Local	A	Knibbe	Loeb	7-0
Ruddiman School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0 Radcliff asked about the light brick addition to the building. Boscarino stated that the addition was added in the 1950s and that both buildings are roughly equal in size.
Redford School	List	Local	A, C	Staley	Knibbe	7-0
Harding and Hurly School	List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Evans	7-0

Holcomb School	List	Local	A, C	Staley	Loeb	7-0
Mettetal School	List	Local	A, C	Evans	Loeb	7-0
Bagley School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Staley	7-0
Arthur School	List	Local	C	Staley	Loeb	7-0
Von Steuben School	List	Local	C	Evans	Radcliff	7-0
Dixon School	List	Local	C	Evans	Radcliff	7-0
Chaney School	List	State	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0 Conway asked about the greenhouse additions on many schools. Boscarino replied that they were ubiquitous during a certain period of school building. Chapman added that it was part of a movement to bring the parks to the schools. Harms noted that it was seen nationally in the 1910s through the 1930s.
Western School	List	Local	C	Staley	Evans	7-0
Burbank School	List	Local	C	Loeb	Staley	7-0
Crary School	List	Local	C	Evans	Ligibel	7-0 Boscarino added that the DHDAB recommended against listing this building because another building in better condition is still extant.
Parkman School	List	Local	C	Radcliff	Ligibel	7-0
MacDowell School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Evans	7-0
Herman School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Vernor School	List	Local	C	Evans	Ligibel	7-0 Boscarino added that this is the first International Style school building constructed in the DPS system. Knibbe expressed concern about the significance of this building.

Everett/Cody School	List	State	C	Ligibel	Staley	7-0
Carelton School	List	Local	A, C	Ligibel	Staley	4-3 Knibbe and Radcliff expressed concern about the significance of this building. Conway asked how many buildings were not included in the nomination. Boscarino replied that they actually surveyed 200+ buildings and submitted 93 for nomination.
Ann Arbor Trail School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Loeb	3-4 Knibbe motioned to not list the building. The motion to not list the Ann Arbor Trial School fails. Goldstein mentioned that 39 buildings in the survey were identified as Modern. Ligibel motioned to list the building. The motion to list failed 3-4.
Barton School	Not List			Knibbe	Ligibel	7-0 Knibbe noted that there are better examples of International Style buildings found in the suburbs.
Pitcher School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Evan	7-0
Mumford High School	List	State	A, C	Knibbe	Radcliff	7-0 Goldstein noted that this building was designed by a group of architects that had previously worked for Smith, Hinchman & Grylls.
McColl School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Dow School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	6-1 Boscarion noted that the DHDAB recommended against listing this building.

Vandenburg School	Not List			Knibbe	Evans	5-2
Larned School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Loeb	7-0 Knibbe noted that this building was designed by Minoru Yamasaki.
Kosciusko School	List	Local	C	Knibbe	Staley	4-3 Radcliff asked what was behind the steel panels. Goldstein stated that glass block and windows were originally located behind the steel panels.
Ford High School	List	Local	C	Ligibel	Evans	7-0
Osborn School	Not List	Local	A, C	Knibbe	Radcliff	5-2 Boscarino noted that the DHDAB recommended against listing this building.